## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY (RE-REVISED)

### FOR

## **EVALUATION STUDY**

ON

# "PRE MATRIC SCHOLARSHIPS TO THE CHILDREN OF THOSE ENGAGED IN OCCUPATIONS INVOLVING CLEANING AND PRONE TO HEALTH HAZARDS"

**SPONSORED** 

BY

## MINISTRY OF SOCIAL JUSTICE & EMPOWERMENT GOVERNMENT OF INDIA

**SUBMITTED** 

BY

## SANTEK CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD. DELHI-110091

santekconsultants@gmail.com, ssss\_x@rediffmail.com (October 2020)

### LIST OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER NO.	PARTICULARS	PAGE NO.
I	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1-7
	The Scheme	1
	Study Design	1
	Key Study Findings	1
	Suggestions and Feedback	5
	Recommendations	6

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

#### The Scheme

The Government of India is implementing the Scheme of Pre-Matric Scholarship to children of those engaged in 'unclean' occupations since 1977-78. Under the scheme, 100% central assistance is provided to State Governments/UT Administrations from the Government of India for the total expenditure under the Scheme, over and above their respective Committed Liability. The level of Committed Liability of respective State Governments/ Union Territory Administrations for a year is equivalent to the level of actual expenditure incurred by them under the scheme during the terminal year of the last Five Year. The current version of the scheme is known as Scheme of Pre-Matric Scholarships to the Children of those Engaged in Occupations Involving Cleaning and Prone to Health Hazards (as notified by the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment letter no.11014/04/2017-SCD-V dt. 2<sup>nd</sup> April 2018).

#### **Objective of the Scheme**

The objective of the scheme is to provide financial assistance to children whose parents/ guardian belongs to one of the following categories, to pursue Pre-matric education :

- i. Persons who are Manual Scavengers as defined under section 2(1) (g) of Manual Scavengers Act 2013
- ii. Tanners& Flayers
- iii. Waste pickers and
- iv. Persons engaged m hazardous cleaning as defined in Section 2(1) (d) of Manual Scavengers Act 2013

As per the guidelines of the Ministry the value of Scholarship and Ad-hoc Grant is :

- ➢ For Hostellers : The students as hostellers will be covered from class III to X. The rates of scholarships are Rs. 700/- per month for 10 months
- For Day Scholars: The students as day scholars will be covered from Class I to Class X. The rates of scholarships are Rs. 225/- per month for 10 months
- Ad-hoc Grant: Adhoc grant of Rs. 750/- per student per annum to all day scholars and Rs. 1000/- per student per annum to hostellers would be admissible.

#### Study Design

For the Study, Ministry had identified the States of Maharashtra, Gujarat, Odisha, Tamil Nadu, Mizoram, Himachal Pradesh and Uttarakhand from the 5 Zones of the country for in-depth study. The Sampling Frame was the various stakeholders concerned with the Scheme, from these selected states. The reference year for study as well as sampling unit selection was FY 2018-19. A survey was undertaken for collection of both Primary as well as Secondary data in the sample states during the months of January and February 2020.

#### Key Study Findings

The salient findings of the study / survey are as follows :

- Financial Progress : Gujarat received Central Funding only till 2014-15 and thereafter it has been continuing the scheme from the State's own resources / budget (as per clause of committed liability). Himachal Pradesh received Central Funding till 2018-19. Mizoram received Central Funding till 2016-17 and stopped continuation thereafter, Uttarakhand received Central Funding till 2014-15, continued the scheme in 2015-16 from its own resources and stopped continuation thereafter. Odisha received Central Funding till 2015-16 and is continuing the Scheme from the State's own resources / budget (as per clause of committed liability). Tamil Nadu has not received any Central Funding since 2014-15 and is managing the scheme from the State's own resources / budget (as per clause of committed liability). Maharashtra did not implement the scheme in the years 2017-18 and 2018-19, and did not provide any other details. The States of Uttarakhand & Mizoram also did not implement this scheme in FY 2018-19 as they neither receive any aid / assistance from the Ministry nor did they utilize the State's own financial resources / budget for implementation
- Physical Progress : As per the State Government of Gujarat, total students enrolled in FY 2018-19 and getting

Executive Summary- Evaluation Study on "Pre Matric scholarships to the children of those Engaged in Occupations involving Cleaning and Prone to Health Hazards" Page |1

the scholarship were 10,481,888, out of which 5,653,619 were males and 4,828,269 were females. In Himachal Pradesh the number of beneficiaries in the year 2017-18 were 2,284 and in the year 2018-19 these were 1,761. In Odisha the beneficiaries during the year 2018-19 were 536 and in Tamil Nadu the number of beneficiaries during the year 2018-19 were 38,916. In Mizoram, Uttarakhand and Maharashtra there were no beneficiaries for the FY 2018-19 as the scheme was not implemented at all

- Of the various institutions whose beneficiaries were surveyed almost 96.8% were government / aided while 3.2% were private approved schools
- ✤ Of the various institutions whose beneficiaries were surveyed 27.9% were in Urban areas and 72.1% in Rural areas
- About 70.1% of the institutions felt that payment of scholarship and allowances directly to student's accounts has had a positive impact on the enrolment of students
- About 29.2% of the institutions confirmed that support was provided to the students by educational institution/ NSKFDC for applying for the scholarship
- In none of the surveyed states, applications are being taken online directly filled by students / applicants / beneficiaries. The students are filling forms which are submitted to the schools in Gujarat and the school is uploading the details online for consideration of higher authorities
- About 52% of the schools are providing free facilities / access to computer and internet to encourage and assist students in enrolling for the scholarship
- Attendance marking is done physically in all surveyed schools
- Enrolment/ on line processing : States are not maintaining any separate data w.r.t Status of enrolment of students from the target communities (male and female), their percentage, target communities. Infact, this itself is a major constraint in identification of eligible beneficiaries. Only lists of beneficiaries who are being provided scholarship under this scheme is being maintained at local institution / school level or district level. Surprisingly, in Odisha, many schools themselves do not have details of students being provided scholarships.
- Process of identification and enrolment of eligible beneficiaries from the target group : It is pertinent to mention that every surveyed state has a different procedure of identification and enrolment of the eligible beneficiaries. Most important aspect of less number of enrolment of the students under the scheme is that, the states donot have clear understanding of the scheme and the schemes implementation. Each of the state has its own set of guidelines and procedures of implementation. In almost all the states this scheme is mostly for the SC category of students and not for other caste students whose parents are engaged in unclean or hazardous activities. The States have shown ignorance to the fact that it a scheme under which the beneficiary can be of any caste including general category or OBC category or any other caste category of the state. The most important aspect of the scheme is the Guardians should be engaged in unclean or hazardarous activities (4 activities as mentioned in the scheme) and they can belong to any caste. Another important aspect which the states are ignoring is that the disabled students are also eligible to take scholarship under the scheme and there is a special provision for them. On Receipt of the instruction from the Higher (State Level) Authorities the scheme is announced to enable students for filling up the scholarship form
  - ✓ In Himachal Pradesh the scholarships forms are provided through the schools along with which various documents are to be enclosed, for verification / Identification / selection and enrolment of eligible beneficiaries. These include Aadhaar Card, Bonafide caste certificate issued by Government of Himachal Pradesh, Bank account passbook copy, Unclean occupation certificate provided by GP pradhan / Gram Panchayat, Candidates identified by the Panchayat local body, Caste and home survey of the beneficiaries
  - ✓ In Tamil Nadu the papers / documents utilized for identification / enrolment of eligible beneficiaries are Resident certificate, Aadhaar certificate, Occupation certificate of parents /guardians (from companies/ organizations for whom working), Parent working certificate (issued by Tanneries), Income certificate Issued by Tehsildar, Parent working certificate - issued by Village Administrative Officer (VAO)
  - ✓ In Odisha papers / documents utilized for identification / enrolment of eligible beneficiaries are Caste certificate, Occupation certificate, Income certificate, Adhaar card, Bank Account pass book, Ration card, Resident certificate.
  - ✓ In Gujarat while the applications are taken online (student fill up the form and submit to school then school upload it on Gujarat Govt. Portal), the papers / documents utilized for identification / enrolment of eligible beneficiaries are Income certificate, Caste certificate, Bank account details, Aadhaar card, Birth certificate, Occupation certificate, Ration card, Certificate Issued by GP secretary

- \* Problems being faced in identifying students who are offspring of tanners and flyers, waste pickers and **persons engaged in hazardous cleaning.** : In the scheme there is no proper definition of the tanners and flyers, waste pickers and persons engaged in hazardous cleaning. There is a lot of confusion among the officials at various levels regarding, who can be the actual beneficiaries of the scheme. Most of the officials understand Manual scavengers and they are very sure that this category of guardians is reducing and is almost negligible in their state or in their district, so there are very less number of beneficiaries. They give importance only to this aspect or category and not on the other 3 categories which are mentioned in the scheme. In urban areas, the Safai-Karamcharis of the Municipalities, nagar-palikas, etc. (who are getting government salary or are enrolled with the municipalities as safai-karamcharis) are taking the benefit under the scheme. The rest of the poor who are engaged in waste picking are not considered as they hardly have any proper documents for getting the benefit. The poor who are engaged in hazardous works in factories or in industries (like cement, mining, steel, etc which have hazardous conditions or hazardous environment) are also not considered under the scheme due to the poor understanding of the scheme by the implementing officials of the scheme. Another problem being faced in the identification of the students is that the guardians are not coming up to fill the forms, as most of them are illiterate and have to fend themselves by undertaking labour work through daily wages. They cannot skip the work to complete the formalities of the school or for filling the forms. In most of the cases the parents have to do lot of running around various offices for getting the certificates and fulfilling the formalities. Due to this they loose many working days and are reluctant to fill the forms. In some cases the school teachers visit the homes of the students and try to facilitate the parents with filling up of the forms, but in the paucity of the proper documents, the teachers are also helpless (even though they are convinced that the students and needy and are eligible to get the benefit under the scheme.
  - ✓ In Himachal Pradesh problems are being faced. Since some of the certificates desired for assessing the occupation of parents / guardians are not standardized, therefore it is a constraint especially for those who are unable to procure unclean occupation certificate from some specified authorities. Many a times their parents are unable to procure requisite documents for evidence in time. Another barrier which has been observed is that many children & or their parents are hesitant to declare /make public their occupation to community / school management & school children.
  - ✓ In Tamil Nadu eligible children available under this scheme are mainly from Tanners as there are a number of tanneries in Vellore and nearby districts. These tanneries do not have any specified format of occupation certificate, therefore sometimes it is difficult to assess the genuineness of these certificates. Other categories are hardly available and there is no database of such categories.
  - ✓ In Odisha there are no guidelines for waste pickers so hardly any child is enrolled in this category. As in other states social stigma is also a barrier in Odisha due to which many eligible beneficiaries are not opening out regarding occupation of their parents & thus not opting for this scholarship. Getting occupation certificate is a problem here.
  - ✓ In Gujarat no verification is being done for assessing the claim of a child's parent being engaged in unclean occupation. Generally and parent self declaration is taken regarding the parent being a tanner of a flayer.
- Migration to online processing of disbursal of scholarships : While Gujarat has more or less migrated to online processing of disbursal of scholarships, the other states are still in the process. Therefore in other states most of the applications are still taken physically / manually
- Provision of unique ID to eliminate possibilities of duplication and false claims : All states have reported that they are giving a unique ID in order to eliminate possibilities of duplication and false claims
- Support provided to the students for applying for the scholarship- whether on line applications are accepted especially in rural areas : Only in Gujarat state adequate effort is being made to enroll as many beneficiaries as possible, but in other states more efforts are desirable
- Shifting of scholarship to Parents/ guardians account (logistic problem): In most of the States, students accounts have been opened, only in few cases scholarship is being transferred into guardians account. The only problem the students and the guardians are facing is not opening of the Zero balance accounts. The banks are not inclined to open zero balance accounts and the students are required to maintain a minimum balance of Rs 500 or Rs 1000, which the students and guardians hesitate on. The guardians are of the opinion that full funds should be withdrawn and the accounts should not get deactivated if no transaction is done
- Encouragement and assistance to children through NSKFDC in enrolling for scholarship, by providing access to computer and internet: No role of NSKFDC has been reported
- \* Provision for renewal of scholarships online : There is No provision for renewal of scholarship online
- \* **Renewal percentage :** Renewal percentage is not really an issue as all those who are getting scholarship would

certainly want to renew given an opportunity. Problem is that the states are not sure whether the scheme will be available in all the years, due to committed liability concept

- Registering of beneficiaries on the portal with full details of their accreditation, fee structure etc. duly vetted by concerned regulatory authority of the States/UTs : Large scale online processing is done only in Gujarat and in other states it is still in initial stages. Overall in 49.3% cases online registration has been reported
- Payment/Mode of Disbursal of Scholarship : As per the respondents, each of the state governments are following different process for release of funds to the districts, institutions and beneficiaries In Gujarat in almost all of the cases DBT is being done. In Tamil Nadu and Himachal Pradesh, in almost all of the cases DBT is being done. In Odisha in most of the cases DBT is being done while in remaining cases payment is made through cheque or cash or otherwise. Overall in 84.4% cases DBT is being done ( to students accounts and parents accounts combined)
- DBT of scholarship and annual grant etc. to students : In Gujarat in most of the cases DBT is being done to beneficiaries'/ students account directly. Only in those cases where the beneficiaries are too small and do not have accounts in their own name, the DBT is done to their parents' account. In Tamil Nadu all disbursements are done by DBT to the students' account only. In Himachal Pradesh almost all disbursements are done by DBT to the students' account except in few cases
- Periodicity of release of scholarship and allowances: Periodicity of release in majority of the cases 82.5% is irregular. In none of the states monthly release has been reported
- Timely release of scholarship / ad-hoc grants / additional allowance : Strictly speaking timely means monthly i.e. the beneficiary student should get the scholarship every month to take care of his expenses specifically related to educational and related needs. However, this is not happening at all anywhere in the surveyed states
- Sufficiency of scholarship & other allowance amount: Only 39% of the respondents feel that the amount is sufficient for meeting basic needs of beneficiaries to continue his / her study, while remaining feel that the amount is too less
- Impact of scholarship in continuing further studies & dropout rates: 72.7% respondents feel that scheme has enabled students to continue further studies at post matric level & considerably reduced dropout rates
- Inspection and Monitoring of the scheme : None of the states have reported to have an integrated IT enabled monitoring mechanism in place to monitor physical and financial performance of the scheme. Since the amount is released only once, so maybe they are still not feeling the need for the same or are yet to get serious about creating / providing such facility
- The States/ Union Territories are not maintaining year wise details of students receiving scholarship, indicating district wise school/ college/ institute with complete address, government or private, class/ course, gender and new/ renewal scholarship, centrally. At the state level data is only available for total numbers and total amount, but for lower level detailed data / information, one has to go to the district and in some cases school level
- None of the States have been able to demonstrate that they are placing relevant physical and financial details on their official website/ Scholarship portal, easily accessible to all including public and common man
- NSKFDC have denied receiving any reports on quarterly basis w.r.t data of beneficiaries and expenditure under the scheme, regularly in the form of Quarterly Progress Report, by respective States/ Union Territories implementing the scheme
- NSKFDC has denied making any efforts whatsoever to submit the Quarterly Progress Report to Govt. of India
- Some system of Grievance Redressal seems to be in place in state of Himachal Pradesh, while the rest of the states have not been able to provide details of any designated Grievance Redressal Officers (GROs) at the State/ District level
- Satisfaction with Current Scheme : Majority of the respondents are Satisfied with the current scheme. Almost one fourth of the respondents were not satisfied with the scheme, as the scheme is not fully understood by the implementers and the schools find it very difficult to identify the actual beneficiaries and convince the guardians to bring so many certificates under the scheme every year. Further no proper guidelines are given by the State governments regarding who can be the beneficiary under the scheme.

## SANTEK CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED DELHI

Following are the key conclusions of this study :

- From the initial observation of the physical and financial progress / achievements of the scheme in the last 10-15 years, it can be concluded that the scheme seems to have shrunk drastically both in physical as well as financial terms. In the year 2006-07 the total funds released under the Scheme were Rs 2025.2 Lakhs and the corresponding beneficiaries were 655,700; In the year 2012-13 the total funds released under the Scheme were Rs 999.95 Lakhs and the corresponding beneficiaries were Rs 311.96 Lakhs and the corresponding beneficiaries were 1,836. There is a significant fall in the funds released and the number of beneficiaries.
- ✤ As regards the fund flow mechanism from centre to states, it has been observed that normally the funds are transferred only once in a year generally for the whole year.
- In the scheme the task of awareness generation has been assigned to NSKFDC, but they have denied having any knowledge about the same.
- There is lack of clarity w.r.t selection of beneficiaries as well as w.r.t the definition of the various categories from which beneficiaries are to be selected.
- In Gujarat, Odisha this scheme has been limited to SC children / beneficiaries only, as if this scheme is exclusively meant for SC children only.
- In Himachal Pradesh this scheme has been by and large limited to Mandi District mainly, while it can find beneficiaries in other districts also.

#### **Suggestions and Feedback**

Some suggestions / feedback given by State Governments for Strengthening the Scheme are as follows :

- Almost all the states have given a feedback that they strongly feel that GoI should take more interest to expand the coverage under this scheme and its efficacious continuity. They also feel that the confusion related to implementation of this scheme as per guidelines of 'Committed Liability Computation Formula', need to be soughted out as soon as possible and there should be clear cut definition / formula for assessing the committed liability to avoid any dispute/s between the states and the centre regarding the amount of 'Committed Liability'. For example on case of Maharashtra their committed liability is Rs. 20.70 cr, whereas the GoI feels that it is Rs. 27.80 cr. Since this confusion has not been soughted out, therefore the State of Maharashtra has not been able to take the benefit of this scheme for the FY 2017-18 and 2018-19
- Gujarat : The state government feels that the Committed Liability Concept should be done away with or kept at a very low level [ratio of 75:25(Central / State)]. The schools / institutions have expressed that they should also be kept in loop w.r.t all scholarship issues whether it is finalization, disbursement, amount disbursed, etc. They feel that in the current process the schools do not come to know when the amount has been disbursed, how much has been disbursed, etc. They have suggested that a confirmation mail should be sent to schools as soon as the amount is released to the students by DBT. Amount should be paid on monthly basis at the beginning of each corresponding month. Even if it is released yearly then it should be released at the beginning of the year. Complete guideline of the scheme should be made available to all parents/guardians of eligible children and issues should also be discussed during parent teacher meetings. Increased Awareness is desirable to be given to school level & parent of such community.
- Himachal Pradesh : State government has refrained from providing any significant comments regarding the scheme & its implementation. However, w.r.t Awareness generation, more efforts should be made by Department District level- Block- Panchayat notice board, school notice board, PTA meetings, Morning assembly–Mahila Mandal–Local News Paper. State further suggests that concept of Committed Liability of State should be done away with & scheme should be genuinely a 100% Centrally sponsored scheme. They felt that there is a need to advertise the scheme in local newspaper and local TV channels along with clear-cut details about critical dates, etc., and in other public places and local bodies so as to ensure wider publicity. Scholarships should not only be released timely both by GoI & State Government, but also released on monthly basis, every month. Increased Awareness is desirable to be given to school level & parent of such community.
- Mizoram : The state government strongly feels that the Sanction should be accorded as and when the proposals are submitted by respective state Government / Union Territory Administration in order to disburse the

## SANTEK CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED DELHI

scholarship amount in time. The suggestions / modifications for making the implementation of the scheme more efficacious, are Awareness generation : Concerned Ministry may announce opening of the scheme well in advance , So as to give wide publicity in time by the state Government, Transparency : Payment may be made through public Financial Management System (PFMS) for Information and Transparency, Functioning and strengthening of the Grievance Redressal Officers : Grievance Redressal mechanism may be initiated in the state level as well as in the concerned Ministry, Committed Liability Concept : Committed liability of Respective state Government / Union territory Administration may be removed from the state due to financial problem, Need to adopt any other sharing pattern for better and smooth implementation of the scheme : The current Pattern is quite satisfactory for better and smooth implementation of the scheme

- Uttarakhand : The state government feels that the Committed Liability Concept should be done away with or kept at a very low level.
- Odisha : The state government feels that the Committed Liability Concept should be done away with or kept at a very low level [ratio of 75:25(Central / State)]. They felt that there was a need to advertise the scheme in local newspaper and local TV channels along with the clear-cut details about the critical dates, etc., and in other public places and local bodies so as to ensure wider publicity.
- Tamil Nadu : The state government has refrained from providing any significant comments regarding the scheme and it implementation. However, w.r.t Awareness generation : more efforts should be made by Department District level- Block- Panchayat notice board, school notice board and Morning assembly Mahila Mandal Local News Paper. They also felt that there was a need to advertise the scheme in local newspaper and local TV channels along with the clear-cut details about the critical dates, etc., and in other public places and local bodies so as to ensure wider publicity. The state further suggests that concept of Committed Liability of State should be done away with & scheme should be genuinely a 100% Centrally sponsored scheme.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

Some recommendations based on the survey undertaken and feedback is being provided below :

- There is an urgent need to first reformulate the scheme such that the scheme clearly lays down the role of various stakeholders and agencies involved in implementation of the scheme. Some role has been provided to NSKFDC, while the corporation denies even the knowledge of this role. All confusions should be resolved immediately and if at all some role is provided to NSKFDC, then it should be ensured that they are doing their bit in a thorough professional manner.
- The definition of categories of Flayers, Tanners, and Waste Pickers should be clear.
- Definition of occupation per se should also be clear, for example sweeping and swabbing is done commonly in every home, but that does not mean that all those who are doing this sweeping and swabbing can be considered for this scheme.
- Concentrated efforts are required at all levels of every state to identify and listing such category of people and make them aware of the provision under this scheme.
- More and more efforts are required for awareness generation of the various stakeholders, more specially those involved in implementation. For example in Gujarat this scheme is being considered only for SC families / students, while others are also eligible, if they fall under the category of unclean occupation.
- Proposals for the next year should be sought in previous year, such that the funds could be released right in the beginning of the year to the states as well as students.
- As per our understanding the scheme has been conceptualized for making payments to the students on monthly basis and not on yearly basis. Therefore, process should be so oriented that the funds are released to all students on monthly basis, to enable students and their families to utilize these funds on monthly basis for their needs.

## SANTEK CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED DELHI

- There is lot of confusion w.r.t state committed liability. Infact, this has become a deterrent for the states to send proposals. Unless and if this is a larger policy of the Government of India to be followed / applied in all the schemes universally, this should not be made applicable in this scheme.
- ✤ As per information provided to us, processing of proposals at GoI level is also taking considerable time for various reasons. Proposals should be cleared in time bound manner.
- There should be clarity and uniformity in the documents required for proving the occupation of the parent / guardian, to avoid any confusion at the lower level.
- DBT should be made mandatory. All states to ensure the same.
- Some budgetary provision should be made for awareness generation component, IT enabling component, etc.
- NSKFDC should take up its designated responsibilities in a proactive manner, to ensure the spread and success of this scheme.
- Compliance regarding appointment of Grievance Redressal Officers (GROs) at the State/ District level should be made mandatory.
- The Scheme needs to be continued because this is the only scheme in the country which takes care of the educational needs of the people who are engaged in the unclean profession or Hazardarous works. These people face lot of stigma from the people in the villages and are not able to cope up with this and therefore donot encourage their children to go to school as they fear that their wards would also face the same humiliation and stigma. The Objectives of the Scheme are apt and the scheme needs to be propagated in the rural and urban areas as the people who are engaged in these 4 categories of professions are directly or indirectly linked to the various activities of Swachh Bharat.
- The Scheme has to continue with elaborate guidelines, giving specific definitions of the 4 categories. The scheme should clearly spell the selection criteria and the documents required for being eligible. The Centre should formulate a standard implementation mechanism for better implementation, monitoring and getting desired results.
- There is no mechanism to know or estimate the number eligible beneficiaries, as very limited data/ statistics is available with regard to this. So Capacity building of the officials should be done to collect such relevant data and further provisioning should be there in the scheme to estimate the number of eligible beneficiaries.